

**CBRC Annual Meeting Minutes
Camarillo, CA 23-24 January 2015**

23 JAN 2015

Meeting called to order at 1:35pm, 23 January 2015 (Chair presiding). Members Joseph Morlan (Chair), Dan Singer (Vice-Chair), Guy McCaskie (non-voting Secretary), Jon Dunn, John Garrett, Brian Daniels, Peter Pyle, Steve Rottenborn, Adam Searcy, and Tom Benson present.

Welcome and introductory remarks by Morlan.

2014 Minutes. No approval needed; approved in March 2014.

1. Election of Members: Prior to discussion of nominees and potential new members, discussion was held on the requirements members must meet in order to make nominations. Per the Bylaws, nominations must be made in writing to the Chair at least thirty days prior to the Annual Meeting.

a. Election. The terms of Dunn, Pyle, and Rottenborn expire.

Nominations:

Jon Feenstra

Lauren Harter

Kelli Levinson-Heindel

Lisa Hug

Kristie Nelson

Alex Rinkert

Gary Nunn

Scott Terrill

David Van der Pluym

Lauren Harter, Kristie Nelson, and Scott Terrill elected.

2. Election of Chair (one year term) – nomination: Joseph Morlan (Singer), Scott Terrill (Dunn). Morlan elected.

3. Election of Vice-Chair (one year term) – nomination: Dan Singer (Dunn). Singer elected.

4. Election of the Secretary (one year term) – nomination: Tom Benson (Singer). Benson elected.

Bylaw Proposals

1. Amend Article 1 Section A: Morlan proposed adding “independent standing” before the word “committee”. After discussion two motions were put forth. The first, to simply add the word “standing” passed 9-0 (JM, JLD). The second motion, to add the word “independent, failed 1-8 (JM, JLD).

2. Add to Article III Section E 4: (h) Present or cause to be presented an update on the progress of the committee to the WFO members at their annual meeting. Motion did not receive a second.

3. Add to Article VI Section F 3 (d): "...within one month of the Secretary announcing the decision." Motion passed 9-0 (PP, JG).

4. Add to Article VI Section G 2 b: "(iv) "date and/or location uncertain". Motion passed 9-0 (JM, JLD).

5. Amend Article VI Section G 10 (c): A record is not considered to have received a "final" decision and is to be recirculated, or after three circulations is to be presented at a meeting, if it receives from two to four "not accept" votes (identification) or three to four "not accept" votes (other categories). Motion (JM, DS) passed 9-0.

6. Amend Article VI Section G 11: Decision During the Fourth Circulation. A record receiving a fourth and final circulation (see VI.F. (3)(c)) shall have its votes evaluated in the following manner: a record receiving all or all but one "accept" votes shall be accepted. A record receiving two or more "not accept" votes in the categories "identification not established" or "establishment of introduced population questionable" shall not be accepted. A record receiving three or more "not accept" votes in the category "natural occurrence questionable" or "date and/or location uncertain" shall not be accepted. Otherwise the record shall be accepted. Motion (JM, DS) passed 9-0.

7. Amend Article VI Section G 12: Not Accepted Records. Any not accepted record that receives two or more "not accept, identification not established" votes will be published as "not accepted, identification not established." All other not accepted records will be published as "not accepted, natural occurrence questionable (identification accepted)," "not accepted, establishment of introduced population questionable," or "not accepted, date and/or location uncertain" whichever receives more votes; ties between these categories shall be decided by the Committee at the next annual meeting. For records that are not accepted on the basis of "natural occurrence questionable," "establishment of population questionable," or "date and/or location uncertain" it shall already have been established that the identification was accepted. Motion (JM, DS) passed 9-0.

8. Add to Article VI Section I 7: The content of all Committee publications are copyrighted by Western Field Ornithologists and may not be reprinted physically or electronically, or modified in any way without the expressed written consent of the Committee. Motion (JM, JLD) failed 1-8.

Annual Reports

1. The 38th report (2012 records) by Pike, K. Garrett, and Searcy has been published.
2. The 39th report (2013 records) authored by Rottenborn, Daniels, McCaskie, and J. Garrett is expected to circulate for committee review at the end of February 2015.

3. The 40th report (2014 records) will be authored by Dunn, Harter, McCaskie and Singer.

State List

Arctic Warbler – (replace with Arctic/Kamchatka Leaf Warbler) - the committee voted 9-0 for this motion (JM/JLD) based on the AOU 2014 decision to split the Arctic Warbler into three species: Arctic, Kamchatka Leaf, and Japanese Leaf. Kamchatka Leaf Warbler has occurred in Western Alaska on several occasions, but there is no evidence Japanese Leaf Warbler has occurred in North America.

Eastern Yellow Wagtail – (replace with Eastern/Western Yellow Wagtail) -no motion was made to adopt this change.

Gray-cheeked Thrush (replace with Gray-cheeked/Bicknell's Thrush) - no motion was made to adopt this change.

Review List

Additions:

Magnificent/Great/Lesser frigatebird – motion to add (JM, PP) passed 9-0.

Arctic/Kamchatka Leaf Warbler – passed 9-0; see above.

Deletions:

Stejneger's Petrel – no motion made to remove from state list.

Red-tailed Tropicbird – motion to remove (JLD, PP) from the review list failed 4-5.

Magnificent Frigatebird – no motion made to remove from the review list.

Frigatebird sp. – motion to remove (PP, JM) from the review list passed 9-0.

Blue-footed Booby – motion to remove (JM, AS) from the review list passed 9-0 based largely on the enormous incursion in 2013 and the recognition that long-term water temperature regimes in the Pacific largely influence this species status and distribution along the California coast.

Elf Owl – motion to remove (JM, PP) failed 0-9. Members agreed that referencing only a general location in publications or online was advisable in light of this species' precarious status in California.

Yellow-green Vireo – motion to remove (JM, PP) passed 8-1 based on 4+ records per year during past 10 years.

Cape May Warbler – no motion to remove from the review list.

Records brought to the meeting:

Fourth and Final:

The following records without a decision after three rounds of voting were brought to the meeting and discussed before a final circulation:

2013-181 Tundra Bean-Goose at Salton Sea IMP
2013-217 Yellow-billed Loon off Playa Del Rey LA
2012-125 Hawaiian Petrel off Point Conception SBA
2013-165 Glossy Ibis at Modoc NWR MOD
2014-009 Iceland Gull in Bishop INY
2013-083 Winter Wren at Los Pinos Trailhead ORA
2013-086 Pyrrhuloxia in Rolling Hills, Palo Verdes Peninsula LA – included by mistake resulting from clerical error. Record accepted after three rounds. Removed due to clerical error.

“Same Bird” records:

2009-260 Iceland Gull at Half Moon Bay SM 25 Jan 2009
2009-261 Iceland Gull near Davis YOL 12 Feb-28 Mar 2009

Meeting adjourned at 8:55pm.

24 January 2015

Meeting reconvened at 8:24am.

Fourth and Final results:

2013-181 Tundra Bean-Goose at Salton Sea IMP – accepted 9-0
2013-217 Yellow-billed Loon off Playa Del Rey LA – accepted 9-0
2012-125 Hawaiian Petrel off Point Conception SBA – accepted 9-0
2013-165 Glossy Ibis at Modoc NWR MOD – accepted 8-1
2014-009 Iceland Gull in Bishop INY – rejected 7-2
2013-083 Winter Wren at Los Pinos Trailhead ORA – accepted 9-0

Procedural clarification on date range extensions and restrictions:

After publication of a record in an annual report a super majority (9-0 or 8-1) is required to modify a date range. These records will be brought to a meeting and any accepted change will be published in the corrigenda of the next annual report. The Secretary has the discretion to accept date extensions prior to a record being published in an annual report, but any member may object and request the record be brought to a meeting for discussion.

“Same Bird” records:

2009-260 Iceland Gull at Half Moon Bay SM 25 Jan 2009

2009-261 Iceland Gull near Davis YOL 12 Feb-28 Mar 2009
Committee voted 6-3 these records did not involve the same bird.

2012-019 Crested Caracara at Point Piedras Blancas, SLO – date extended to 9 Feb (9-0).
2013-109 Crested Caracara at Estero Bluff S.P. and Los Osos SLO from 29 Jun-20 Jul
2013 was accepted as the same bird as a previously accepted individual that ranged from
Los Angeles to Solano counties during 2011-2012 (5-4).

2013-040 Crested Caracara in Pescadero, SM 13 Mar 2014 was accepted as same as
2014-118 and 2014-094 in MTY (9-0).

2014-031 Crested Caracara on Channel Islands, SBA/LA 6 April-19 Jun 2014 considered
same as 2013-063 at Mohave N.P. SBE on 18 May 2013 and 2013-108 at Oxnard, VEN
on 11-14 Jun 2013 (5-4).

2014-038 Crested Caracara in Encinitas, SD 21 April 2014 same as Ocean Beach, SD 9
April 2014 (9-0).

Blue-footed Booby records

2013-257 Blue-footed Booby over Pasadena LA on 11 Sep 2013. Committee received
documentation for a record that had been rejected during its “first round” because there
was no documentation originally submitted with the record. This initial circulation was
made in error. The committee agreed to circulate the record at the meeting and this
circulation is regarded as its first round. The record was accepted (9-0).

Seven Blue-footed Booby records rejected during their first round of circulation because
no documentation was submitted were published in *North American Birds*. A motion
(JM, JLD) to publish these records as “Unsubmitted” passed 9-0. These records include:

2013-254 at Los Angeles River in Long Beach, LA 12 Sep 2013

2013-255 on Belmont Pier in Los Angeles, LA 13 Sep 2013

2013-267 off Point La Jolla, La Jolla, SD 3 Oct 2013

2013-268 at Tijuana River mouth, SD 22 Sep 2013

2013-258 off Tomales Point, MRN 5 Oct 2013

2013-279 off Baldwin Creek, SCZ 8 Oct 2013

2013-281 off Terrace Point, SCZ 19 Sep 2013

Blue-footed Booby records with number and/or date issues - For the sake of consistency,
the committee agreed by consensus to consider birds seen flying past points of land as
different individuals instead of one bird flying by multiple times. These records include:

2013-121 – up to five off Point La Jolla, SD 9-16 Sep 2013 endorsed 9-0.

2013-124 – up to eight off Point Pinos/Monterey harbor, MTY 15 Sep-8 Oct endorsed 9-
0.

2013-131 – up to three at Sutro Baths in San Francisco, SF 16-25 Sep 2013 endorsed 9-0.

2013-149 – up to two at Point Piedras Blancas, SLO 18 Sep-22 Oct involved one report
of up to two perched on a rock 18-26 Sep and a second report of one on a different rock
on 22 Oct. The committee voted 9-0 to consider these two separate records with the latter
record being designated 2013-288 at Arroyo de la Cruz, SLO.

2013-272 – up to seven at Pigeon Point, SM 19-28 Sep 2013 endorsed 7-0.
2013-274 – up four at Moss Beach, SM 16-Sep-1Oct 2013 endorsed 7-0.
2013-280 – one near Davenport, SCZ 17 Sep was endorsed 9-0 but a report from 20 Oct from the same area was considered unsubmitted since no description was received.

Blue-footed Booby records accepted unanimously but with “same bird” issues unresolved:

2013-133 – one at Seacliff, SCZ on 17 and 28 Sep 2013. This record was split with the first date endorsed 9-0 and the last date considered unsubmitted due to no documentation.
2013-137 – one at Morro Bay, SLO 14-15 Sep 2013 and 2013-127 at Montana de Oro SP on 14 Sep 2013 endorsed as separate birds and remain as separate records 9-0.
2013-148 – one off Pescadero, SM on 17 Sep 2013 was endorsed 9-0 while two reports originally included in this record from 27 Sep and 13 Oct contained no documentation and are regarded as unsubmitted.
2013-250 – three birds at Scorpion Harbor and Potato Harbor at Santa Cruz Island, SBA 18 Sep 2013-7 Mar 2014 considered separate from birds on Anacapa Island, VEN (2013-179) endorsed 9-0.

Blue-footed Booby accepted records with date span and same bird issues unresolved:

2013-162 – up to five off Imperial Beach, SD 3 Oct-29 Dec 2013. The Committee voted 9-0 to expand this record to incorporate several records off (or near) Imperial Beach from 2014 including 2014-059, 2014-072, 2014-082, and two records off La Jolla, SD from 2014 including 2014-058 and 2014-068. These 2014 records are considered lingering birds from the 2013 invasion that continued to commute between Los Coronados Islands and feeding sites farther north.

2014-179 – 22 on Anacapa Island, VEN 28 Sep 2013 with one still present until 13 Jul 2014. An adult present 5 Oct 2014 was considered one of these birds and expanded the record date span accordingly. Endorsed 9-0.

2013-158 – one at Samoa, HUM 2 Oct 2013 was accepted after its first round. Based on new information the Chair requested the record circulate for a second round and the committee voted (9-0) in favor of a second circulation.

Frigatebird sp. records brought to the meeting for discussion:

2011-276 – Newport Beach, ORA 10 Sep 11. Record will continue circulating.
2011-277 – Point Loma, SD 30 Oct 11. Accepted to slash category and brought to the meeting for discussion. Record stands as accepted.
2011-278 – Ballona Creek, LA 1 Sep 11. Record will continue circulating.

2013-242 – Malibu, LA 2 Apr 2013. This record was mistakenly circulated as a “Frigatebird sp.”. The original record, 2013-047, circulated as a Magnificent Frigatebird and was rejected 3-6 after one round. However, Dunn requested 2013-047 be recirculated

during the 2014 meeting, so it will now circulate again for its second round of voting. Frigatebird sp. record 2013-242 is voided.

2014-023 – La Jolla, SD 1 July 2014. Accepted to slash category 8-1. Stands as accepted.

Previously accepted Arctic Warbler records:

See State List revision above. All records now considered “Arctic/Kamchatka Leaf Warbler”. Pyle and Tietz agreed to review accepted records and make a recommendation on which records may warrant additional review. Records with measurements will be forwarded to Per Alstrom for his expert opinion.

Other records

1987-073 Garganey at Arcata, HUM 30 Jan-10 Feb 1987. Committee voted (5-4) to re-review this record based on new and substantial documentation.

1999-139/1999-139a “Shy Albatross” west of Point Arena, MEN 24 Aug 1999 and off Sonoma County 25 Sep 1999 was discussed at length in NAB 54:124-135 2000. Based on recent taxonomic changes adopted by the AOU, a motion to consider these records as pertaining to White-capped Albatross passed 9-0 (JLD, PP).

2000-129/2001-144 “Shy Albatross” at Cordell Bank, MRN 29 Jul and 10 Sep 2000.

2001-145 “Shy Albatross” at Bodega Canyon, SON 27 Jul 2001.

The committee voted 9-0 to recirculate both records above as Chatham's Albatross.

2013-173N Masked Booby in Long Beach, LA 6-27 Oct 2013. An immature bird rejected as a Masked 2-7. A motion (JM, BD) to recirculate the record as a Masked/Nazca Booby passed 8-0 (one member abstained).

2014-062 Glossy Ibis at Davis, YOL 27 Jun 2014 brought to the meeting in error.

Accepted 8-1 after first round and will recirculate at the request of one member to consider potential hybridization.

2014-015 Slaty-backed Gull at Ferry Point, CC 5-8 Feb 2014 was not accepted after one round. After discussion no motion was made to continue circulation.

2014-023 Slaty-backed Gull at Arcata, HUM 20 Jan-2 Mar 2014 was not accepted after one round and a request for recirculation was rescinded.

2011-208 Gyrfalcon at Orick, HUM 30 Sep 2011. The committee received a request for this rejected record to be recirculated based on new and substantial documentation. A motion (JM, DS) to recirculate passed 7-2.

2014-048 Gray-cheeked Thrush at Primm Valley, SBE 7 Jun 2014. Brought to the meeting at the request of a member. No motion made to recirculate so record remains accepted.

Budget

Expenses incurred during 2014 totaled \$203. These expenses were covered by McCaskie who refused reimbursement.

Website

Rare Birds of California online. The committee discussed the current status of the ongoing project to have corrections completed.

The Wfo-cbrc.org domain name, which points to the CBRC website, was renewed for three years.

Database upgrade and query update. Morlan and Tietz discussed ongoing efforts to improve the database. Benson, Morlan and Tietz will continue to address the need for enhanced data query functions and eliminating unnecessary functionality.

Annual Reports online. All annual reports are now available on the CBRC website.

Archiving at Western Foundation of Vertebrate Zoology

Searcy updated the committee on the current state of CBRC record archiving at WFVZ. Digital and paper copies are stored separately. Searcy currently is maintaining the files since Peg Stevens has retired; a search for volunteers to take on this task is ongoing.

Introduced Birds Subcommittee

The Introduced Birds Subcommittee report is attached as an addendum to these minutes. The committee approved a watch list of introduced species and agreed this will be posted on the CBRC website.

Subcommittee appointments – continuing members include Kimball Garrett (chair) and Adam Searcy, and new members are Tom Benson and John Garrett.

CBRC/eBird relationship

Some members expressed concern that review species entered into eBird were not being passed along to the committee by eBird reviewers.

CBRC/WFO relationship

In light of the expanding role of *Western Birds* as a publication resource for record committee annual reports, Dunn discussed his desire for committee members to contribute to page charges for the printing of annual reports. Dunn suggested setting a goal of 50% of the cost of each report (approximately \$350). The committee agreed to encourage members to contribute even a small amount annually.

Yellow-bellied Flycatcher identification

Pyle led a discussion on new identification criteria presented by Bauman et. al. 2014. After reviewing specimens Pyle's assessment was the gap between the greater coverts and the secondary edgings is a useful character that needs more testing. Primary spacing remains useful as a secondary character. Caution is warranted when assessing photographs. Foreshortening can affect not only perception of the apparent width of the gap between the greater coverts and secondary edgings, but also the spacing between the tips of the outer primaries.

Next Meetings

Morlan agreed to give a presentation on the CBRC's work at the Billings, Montana conference in June 2015.

The 2016 meeting is tentatively scheduled for 29-30 January at the offices of H.T. Harvey and Associates in Los Gatos.

Appreciations

1. Dunn, Pyle and Rottenborn for their service to the committee.
2. Guy McCaskie for his critical work as Secretary over many, many years. Morlan presented Guy with artwork from Keith Hansen as a thank you from committee members past and present.
3. Jim Tietz for maintaining updates to "Rare Birds" on our website.
4. WFVZ, Linnea Hall, and Adam Searcy for hosting and archiving services.

Adjournment

6:10pm, 24 January 2015.

Dan Singer – Vice-chair

ADDENDUM

California Bird Records Committee Introduced Birds Sub-Committee Report January 2015

Kimball L. Garrett, Joseph Morlan, James E. Pike

The Introduced Birds Sub-Committee (IBSC) was generally not active over the past year, although KLG further researched the status of various introduced species in California (and elsewhere in the West) for a paper to be included in the forthcoming WFO symposium volume on avifaunal change, and JM did additional research on the status of Mandarin Duck in California. At this point, we can offer a reasonably solid list of naturalized species “to watch” (as agreed at last year’s meeting).

The following list includes introduced bird species in California that are known to be breeding in the wild and have populations likely totaling 100 or more individuals, but which either do not yet meet all of the criteria for addition to the California state list or may meet these criteria but have yet to have a proposal developed for addition to the list. These eleven species meet most of the CBRC criteria for addition to the California state list, but at this point some must either be considered either “data deficient” or are geographically limited enough within California to call into question the wisdom of adding them to the official state list at this point.

We propose that the CBRC formalize this “**Watch List**” of naturalized species that merit detailed study to determine whether all CBRC criteria for addition to the state list have been met. This list should be published in the CBRC minutes, on the CBRC web site, and in *Western Birds* (as a notice, or as part of a CBRC annual report). The IBSC will maintain files on these species to serve as the basis for a potential listing package.

Mute Swan, *Cygnus olor*

Egyptian Goose, *Alopochen aegyptiaca*

Rose-ringed Parakeet, *Psittacula krameri*

Mitred Parakeet, *Psittacara mitratus*

Red-masked Parakeet, *Psittacara erythrogenys*

Nanday Parakeet, *Aratinga nenday*

Yellow-chevroned Parakeet, *Brotogeris chiriri*

Lilac-crowned Parrot, *Amazona finschi*

Red-whiskered Bulbul, *Pycnonotus jocosus*

Northern Red [=Orange] Bishop, *Euplectes franciscanus*

Pin-tailed Whydah, *Vidua macroura*

A second list includes species which seem farther, for various reasons, from meeting the CBRC criteria but certainly need to be monitored. Those preceded by a “?” likely have populations only in double figures, have little or no proof of breeding in the wild in California (though almost certainly do so), and/or have been established for well under fifteen years. It is likely that several additional species with very small, local breeding populations could be added to this list. Three species on this list (Mandarin Duck, Red-lored Parrot, and Yellow-headed Parrot) might deserve a place on the above list (the CBRC “Watch List”). All three have populations at least in the mid- to high double figures and have been breeding in California for >10 years (Red-lored Parrot) or >30 years (the Mandarin Duck and Yellow-headed Parrot), but the only significant populations of each are localized in one or two counties.

Mandarin Duck, *Aix galericulata*

Blue-crowned Parakeet, *Thectocercus acuticaudatus*

Red-lored Parrot, *Amazona autumnalis*

Turquoise-fronted Parrot, *Amazona aestiva*

Yellow-headed Parrot, *Amazona oratrix*

Black-throated Magpie-Jay, *Calocitta colliei*

Oriental White-eye, *Zosterops palpebrosus* /Japanese White-eye, *Zosterops japonicus*

White-collared Seedeater, *Sporophila torqueola*

European Goldfinch, *Carduelis carduelis*

Bronze Mannikin, *Spermestes cucullata*

Orange-cheeked Waxbill, *Estrilda melpoda*

Recommendations of the Introduced Birds Sub-Committee

(1) The CBRC should evaluate, modify (as needed) and approve, the recommended “Watch List” of introduced species to consider for developing a listing proposal. This list should be publicly announced through the CBRC web site and a notice in *Western Birds* (either free-standing, or as part of a CBRC annual report), with recommendations that interested observers seek data on the included species and, as appropriate, publish information on their status, distribution and biology.

[Note: We hope and presume that the establishment of the “Watch List” does not require a by-law change. If the sense of the committee is that a by-law revision would be required, we could get around this by making the list a simple recommendation of the IBSC and CBRC rather than a “formal” list.]

(2) Re-appoint an Introduced Birds Sub-Committee for 2015